



City of Santa Clara

HISTORICAL AND LANDMARKS COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, November 7, 2013 – 7:00 P.M.
CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS
1505 Warburton Avenue
Santa Clara, CA 95050

Please refer to the Historical and Landmarks Commission Procedural Items guideline for information on all procedural matters.
An audio recording of this meeting is available in the Planning Office for review or purchase the Friday following the meeting.

ITEMS FOR COUNCIL ACTION

The following items from this Historical and Landmarks Commission agenda will be scheduled for Council review following the conclusion of hearings and recommendations by the Historical and Landmarks Commission. Due to timing of notices for Council hearings and the preparation of Council agenda reports, these items will not necessarily be heard on the date the minutes from this meeting are forwarded to the Council. Please contact the Planning Division office for information on the schedule of hearings for these items:

- **Agenda Item No. 8.B.:** 554 Mansion Park Drive [4750 Lick Mill Boulevard]

1. CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order at 7:01 p.m.

2. ROLL CALL

Commissioners Present: Chair Brian Johns, Robert Luckinbill, Kris Motyka, Jerry McKee and J.L. Standifer

Commissioners Excused: Jeannie Mahan and Michael Hyams

Staff Present: Yen Chen, Associate Planner and Jeff Schwilk, AICP, Associate Planner

3. DISTRIBUTION OF AGENDA AND STAFF REPORTS

Copies of current agendas and staff reports for each of the items on the agenda are available from the Planning Division office on the Friday afternoon preceding the meeting and are available at the Commission meeting at the time of the hearing. Chair Johns reviewed this procedure.

4. DECLARATION OF COMMISSION PROCEDURES

Chair Johns reviewed the Historical and Landmarks Commission procedures for those present.

5. REQUESTS FOR EXCEPTIONS, WITHDRAWALS AND CONTINUANCES

- A. Withdrawals – None
- B. Continuances – None
- C. Exceptions – None

6. ORAL PETITIONS/ANNOUNCEMENTS AND COMMUNICATIONS

Sarah Doty noted that she is performing a study on historical properties in the City and requested to be placed on a future agenda.

Mr. Chen noted a request by the Commission to have the Honorary City Historian be seated with the Commissioners. It was moved by Commissioner Motyka, seconded by Commissioner Luckinbill and was carried (5-0-0-2, Mahan and Hyams absent) to allow Lorie Garcia, Honorary City Historian, to sit with the Commission in an advisory role.

7. CONSENT CALENDAR

Consent Calendar items may be enacted, approved or adopted, based upon the findings prepared and provided in the written staff report, by one motion unless requested to be removed by anyone for discussion or explanation. If any member of the Historical and Landmarks Commission, staff, the applicant or a member of the public wishes to comment on a Consent Calendar item, or would like the item to be heard on the regular agenda, please notify Planning staff, or request this action at the Historical and Landmarks Commission meeting when the Chair calls for these requests during the Consent Calendar review.

7.A. Approval of Historical and Landmarks Commission Minutes for the meeting of October 3, 2013.

Motion/Action:

It was moved by Commissioner Luckinbill, seconded by Commissioner McKee and was carried (3-0-2-2, Motyka and Standifer abstaining, Mahan and Hyams absent) to approve the Minutes of October 3, 2013

*****END OF CONSENT CALENDAR*****

8. PUBLIC MEETING ITEMS

8.A. File No.(s):	PLN2013-09973 / PLN2013-09986
Location:	3051 Homestead Road, a 0.68 acre parcel located on the north side of Homestead Road, approximately 175 feet west of Pepper Tree Lane (APN: 290-24-001). Property is zoned Agricultural (A).
Applicant / Owner:	Justin Mozart, Peninsula Communities, Inc.
Request:	Rezone from Agricultural (A) to Planned Development (PD), Tentative Map , and Architectural Review , to demolish an existing single family residence and residential accessory buildings, and develop eight (8) new single family detached homes on a property located within 100 feet of a historic resource
CEQA Determination:	Categorical Exemption per CEQA Section 15332, In-fill Development Projects
Project Planner:	Jeff Schwilk, AICP, Associate Planner
Staff Recommendation:	Recommend Approval, subject to conditions

Notice: The notice of public meeting for these items was posted within 300 feet of the site and was mailed to property owners within 300 feet.

Discussion:

Mr. Schwilk gave a brief presentation of the project. Justin Mozart, owner, presented display boards illustrating the front elevation of the proposed units. Mr. Mozart noted that the

architectural style is Spanish Mediterranean. Commissioner Motyka commented that she would rather see Mission Style and limit the mismatch of window styles.

A historic property report was prepared by Lorie Garcia of Beyond Buildings. According to the report, the site has been largely redeveloped since the house was constructed, removing the relative historic context. The report concludes that the house would not be considered significant under the City's local criterion. Ms. Garcia noted that an initial review concluded that there is no historical significance and that a full report is not warranted. Mr. Schwilk also noted that there is no significant effect on the historic integrity or context of the adjacent listed resource at 3023 Homestead.

The public comment period was opened. Sarah Doty noted that cutting of trees can be a significant impact. She also noted that the property will mostly likely have lead. Mr. Schwilk noted that the trees have been evaluated and some lie within the foot print of the proposed buildings and there is a proposal to replace two trees for each one removed. Mr. Mozart noted that the contractor is required secure permits for asbestos and lead. Mr. Chen noted that lead abatement is a Federal Agency EPA requirement. Chad Kendrick adjacent property owner commented on the advantages of the proposed development from lower density, street improvements, and screening. The public comment period was closed.

The Commission discussed the possibility of saving trees and moving trees. Mr. Schwilk noted the diameter of the redwood tree #5 is 28 inches in diameter.

Motion/Action:

It was moved by Commissioner Motyka, seconded by Commissioner Luckinbill and was carried (5-0-0-2, Mahan and Hyams absent) to recommend approval of the project design with a Mission Style Architecture and saving trees #4 and #5.

8.B.	File No.(s):	PLN2013-10051
	Location:	554 Mansion Park Drive [4750 Lick Mill Boulevard] (APN: 097-08-100). Property is zoned Planned Development-Historical Combining District (PD-HT).
	Applicant/Owner:	Gilbert Sanchez, FAIA / Jenny Wang Agent for Wei Bai
	Request:	Rezone a Historic Combining Zoning District (HT) to allow a pre-school and after school facility at the Lick Mansion; and to allow a film production and art studio at the Granary. The project includes an addition to the rear of the mansion, outdoor interpretative panel, outdoor play areas, and security fencing. This project is consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties with Guidelines for Rehabilitating the Mansion and Granary buildings.
	CEQA Determination:	Categorical Exemption per CEQA Section 15331, Historical Resource Restoration/Rehabilitation
	Project Planner:	Yen Chen, Associate Planner
	Staff Recommendation:	Recommend Approval, subject to conditions

Notice: The notice of public meeting for this item was posted within 300 feet of the site and was mailed to property owners within 300 feet.

Discussion:

Mr. Chen gave a brief presentation of the project. The currently listed uses under the Historic Combining District do not list the pre-school, after school facility, film and art studio uses. Mr. Chen noted that past improvements weather proofed the structure, but did not renovate the

building. He noted that the primary views of the Mansion will remain intact, and the improvements and outdoor uses will be located to the rear or side of the Mansion.

Lorie Garcia, Honorary City Historian, commented on the thoroughness of the preservation plan. Craig Mineweaser, AIA, the Volunteer Architectural Advisor to the HLC noted that the project qualifies under the Secretary of Interior for Rehabilitation. Mr. Mineweaser noted that the drawings show a high level of restoration and preservation effort. He noted that the parts that are new are clearly differentiated from the parts that are historic. Mr. Mineweaser commented that the resource at the end of construction will be perceived to be in the same period of significance and is in favor of the project.

Mr. Gill Sanchez, FAIA, presented a Treatment Summary for the Mansion and Granary. He noted that the new trash enclosure and bicycle lockers will be set to the back of the property. He explained the efforts to limit changes the exterior of the structure. Mr. Sanchez noted that the site is accessed from an easement from Lick Mill Boulevard. There is currently a driveway access to the Mansion and will need to be upgraded to accommodate pedestrian access. Mr. Sanchez noted that the solar panels are part of the project and will be seen on the south elevation. Mr. Mineweaser noted that a skylight style design can help disguise the solar panels. Mr. Sanchez noted that the rear stairs can be salvaged and stored for future use.

The public comment period was opened. Sarah Doty commented on the proper use of a CEQA exemption when dealing with Historic Preservation. She asked whether the architect has been retained to participate through the building construction process. Ms. Doty suggested a mid-way review of the project. She then commented that public access and parking is not adequate. The public comment period was closed. The Commission discussed the comments presented by the public in detail. They noted the need for follow-up inspection reporting and additional public access. Mr. Sanchez noted that he will follow the project from the start to finish. Mr. Mineweaser noted that on residential projects, the architect by contract is not required to manage the project.

Motion/Action:

It was moved by Commissioner Luckinbill, seconded by Commissioner McKee and was carried (5-0-0-2, Mahan and Hyams absent) to recommend approval of the project, subject to the following:

- 1) The owner shall open the property to the public no less than two times per quarter annually;
- 2) The owner shall retain a preservation architect for the project. The preservation architect shall be involved throughout the construction of the project and sign-off the preservation plan at the end of construction;
- 3) The Planning Department shall provide the Commission a mid-point report during the construction of the project;
- 4) The owner shall retain a certified building inspector acceptable to the Planning Director and Building Official to perform the required annual inspection and provide a written report on the care and upkeep of the buildings.

8.C.	File No.(s):	PLN2013-10055
	Location:	3023 Homestead Road, a 19,158 square foot parcel located on the north side of Homestead Road, approximately 70 feet west of Pepper Tree Lane, (APN: 290-25-073). Property is zoned Single Family Residential (R1-6L).
	Applicant/Owner:	Gary Moore & Associates / Chad Kendrick
	Request:	Design Review of a second-story addition and remodel to existing two-story single family residence.
	CEQA Determination:	Categorical Exemption per CEQA Section 15331, Historical Resource Restoration/Rehabilitation

Project Planner: Greg Qwan, Planning Intern
Staff Recommendation: Recommend Approval, subject to conditions

Notice: The notice of public meeting for this item was posted within 300 feet of the site and was mailed to property owners within 300 feet.

Discussion:

Mr. Chen gave a brief presentation on the proposal for a minor second-story addition and remodel of the existing residence. He also explained that future street improvements may necessitate the removal of the existing deodar cedar tree. Mr. Chen noted that deodar cedar tree was incorrectly referred to as a resource in the existing DPR report.

The public comment period was opened. Sarah Doty noted that environmental determination and staff analysis is fundamentally flawed. The public comment period was closed.

Craig Mineweaser, AIA, the Volunteer Architectural Advisor to the HLC noted that the project qualifies under the Secretary of Interior for Rehabilitation. He noted that character defining features on residential properties should be compatible with the existing resource and should be differentiated on commercial developments. Mr. Mineweaser also recommended the use of Historic Building Code or casement windows as an option for the egress windows. Mr. Kendrick stated that he plans to apply for a Mills Act application. The Commission discussed the possibility of qualifying the house as a listed resource. The Commission noted the requirement to have an updated Historic Survey and Evaluation (DPR) for a Mills Act application.

Motion/Action:

It was moved by Commissioner McKee, seconded by Commissioner Luckinbill and was carried (5-0-0-2, Mahan and Hyams absent) to recommend approval of the project design.

It was moved by Commissioner McKee, seconded by Commissioner Luckinbill and was carried (5-0-0-2, Mahan and Hyams absent) that street improvement plans as part of the Official Plan Line for this property does not require to be referred to the Historical & Landmarks Commission for review.

8.D.	File No.(s):	PLN2013-10069
	Location:	500 El Camino Real, Building 109, Santa Clara University Nobili Hall, between Mayer Theater and Adobe Lodge, directly behind the Mission Church (APN: 269-23-073). Property is zoned Public, Quasi-public, and Public Park or Recreation Zoning District (B).
	Applicant/Owner:	Joe Sugg, Santa Clara University
	Request:	Design Review of a lobby expansion in Nobili Hall. The project includes renovation of the interior stairway.
	CEQA Determination:	Categorical Exemption per CEQA Section 15331, Historical Resource Restoration/Rehabilitation
	Project Planner:	Debby Fernandez, Associate Planner
	Staff Recommendation:	Recommend Approval, subject to conditions

Notice: The notice of public meeting for this item was posted within 300 feet of the site and was mailed to property owners within 300 feet.

Discussion:

Mr. Chen gave a brief presentation on the proposal to renovate the interior stairway. Lorie Garcia, Honorary City Historian, provided a Historic Resources Inventory (DPR) prepared by John W. Snyder from Caltrans dated May 29, 1981. Ms. Garcia commented that the property is eligible for National Register of Historic Places. She noted that Nobili Hall is part of the

University of Santa Clara Quadrangle. Ms. Garcia commented that further analysis should be made for the preservation of the interior space. She noted that staff's analysis was only on the rehabilitation of the building. Craig Mineweaser, AIA, the Volunteer Architectural Advisor to the HLC noted that the Historic Building Code is more lenient and allows for preserving the existing materials. He commented that analysis should be made to determine whether the use of the Historical Building Code would limit the removal or destruction of historic fabric. Commissioner Motyka commented that both DPR's are out of date. Mr. Mineweaser noted that one of the purposes of an updated DPR is to help to determine the period of significance.

Brent Dowling, Architect, representing the Santa Clara University, discussed the need for the lobby expansion and renovation of the interior stairway. He noted that the main lobby is split by the stairwell and currently does not provide a secure entry for the upstairs residents. He explained that primary access to the ground floor facilities such as the dining room is from the side of Nobili Hall. He noted there are no exterior alterations to the building and the entirety of project is on the interior.

The public comment period was opened. Sarah Doty commented that staff did not prepare necessary information needed to make a determination on the project. The public comment period was closed. The Commission discussed the need for an updated historic survey and evaluation (DPR) and need for photographs of the interior space. The Commission noted their concerns over changes to a property that is eligible for the National Register of Historic Places. Ms. Garcia noted that it is important to have an evaluation report and pictures. She noted the building is a contributor to the Quadrangle. Mr. Mineweaser noted the effects to a building report should be provided.

Motion/Action:

It was moved by Commissioner Motyka, seconded by Commissioner Luckinbill and was carried (5-0-0-2, Mahan and Hyams absent) to continue the project for a Findings of Effect report and updated Historical Survey and Evaluation (DPR) for the Nobili Hall and if amenable to the University the entire Quadrangle.

9. OTHER BUSINESS

9.A. Commission Procedures and Staff Communications

i. Announcements/Other Items

- Election of Commission Officers
 - This item was continued to December HLC meeting.
- CLG Annual Report 2013-2013 covers period October 1, 2012 thru September 30, 2013 (verbal update)
 - Mr. Chen noted the report is due 12/31/2013. Commissioners are requested to review dates and duration of training completed during the reporting period.
- CLG Grant Program (Yen Chen)
 - Mr. Chen highlighted the response to SHPO on the CLG Grant Program. He recommended that CLG grant applications keep the funding for smaller projects and expand the program for larger grant funding.
- Update on General Plan Appendix of Historically Significant Properties (verbal update)
 - Mr. Chen reported that the updated list is being prepared and will be presented at the December HLC meeting.
- Office of Historic Preservation – eLearning Training (Yen Chen)
 - Mr. Chen reported that the training on Module I and II is complete. YouTube videos produced by VTA on the BRT projects were shown at the end of the training session. The next training will start on Module III.
- Monthly Report on HT properties: Residential reversions (verbal update)
 - None

ii. Report of the Liaison from the Planning and Inspection Department

- City Council and Planning Commission Actions (verbal update)
- iii. Commission/Board Liaison and Committee Reports**
 - Santa Clara Arts and Historic Consortium (McKee / Vacant as alternate)
[Fourth Monday of each month at 7:15 p.m. - Headen-Inman House]
 - Historic Preservation Society of Santa Clara (Mahan / Luckinbill as alternate)
[Second Friday of each month at 10:00 a.m.- Harris Lass Preserve]
 - Old Quad Residents Association (Motyka / Johns as alternate)
 - Architectural Committee (Mahan / Johns as alternate)
 - Agnews Historic Cemetery Museum Committee (Vacant / Luckinbill as alternate)
 - BART/ High Speed Rail/ VTA BRT Committee (Johns / McKee as alternate)
 - Zoning Ordinance Update (Motyka / Vacant as Alternate)
 - Preservation Ordinance Ad-hoc Committee (Motyka and Mahan / Luckinbill and McKee as alternate)
 - Sesquicentennial Celebration (Mahan / Johns as alternate)
- iv. Commission Activities**
 - Commissioner Travel and Training Reports
- v. Upcoming Agenda Items**
 - Draft 2012-2013 Annual Certified Local Government Report – December 2013
 - Annual report on matter of document retention – December 2013
 - Tour of the City's Mackay neighborhoods – February 2014
 - Technical Review of Resources for Maywood Tract – March 2014
 - Franklin Post Office Update (Lorie Garcia) – TBD
 - Review of Street Name List (Lorie Garcia) - TBD

10. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 9:52 p.m. The next regular Historical and Landmarks Commission meeting will be held on Thursday, December 5, 2013 at 7:00 p.m..

Prepared by:


Yen Chen
Associate Planner

Approved:


Gloria Sciara, AICP
Development Review Officer

I:\PLANNING\2013\HLC 2013\10-03-13\HLC Minutes 11.07.13.doc